

Oil Independent Oakland (OIO) By 2020 Task Force

Regular Meeting

Thursday, May 17, 2007, 6:00 pm to 9:00 pm

Minutes

Hearing Room 1, City Hall, One Frank H. Ogawa Plaza

Members:

Jane Seleznow	District 1	Richard Register	District 7
Louise Bedsworth	District 2	Mike Petouhoff	At Large
Ian Kim, Vice Chair	District 3	Parin Shah, Chair	Mayor
James Lutz	District 4	Richard Heinberg	Mayor
Shannon Graham	District 5	Thomas Radulavich	Mayor
David Room	District 6	Patrick Tang, Esq.	Deputy City Attorney
		Kimberly Jones	City Administrator

Task Force Members Present: Seleznow, Kim, Lutz, Graham, Room, Register, Petouhoff, Shah, Radulavich, Heinberg

Task Force Members Excused: Louise Bedsworth

Staff Members Present: Kimberly Jones, City Administrator's Office; Patrick Tang, City Attorney's Office; Marisa Arrona, Councilmember Nadel's Office; Scott Wentworth, Public Works Agency; Alice Glasner, Public Works Committee Legislative Analyst.

Business Meeting

1. Roll Call and Establishment of Quorum.
 - a. Meeting was called to order at 6:07 pm. Roll call was called and a quorum was established.
2. Open Forum.
 - a. There were no speakers for Open Forum
3. Approval of Draft Minutes of May 3, 2007 meeting.
 - a. The Draft Minutes of the May 3, 2007 meeting were unanimously approved, as amended. The amendments were to section 7, to read, "Task Force Member Graham asked if it would be easy to get data from the MTC...." and, "Task Force Member Jim Lutz asked whether the City has sales tax data about gas sold."
4. Approval of Amendments to Resolution No. 80305, C.M.S.
 - a. Marisa Arrona presented the proposed amendments to the Enacting Resolution, which would extend the duration of the OIO Task Force ("TF"). The extension was deemed necessary by staff and the TF due to the April start of the TF meetings and the Summer Recess of the City Council in August.
 - b. Task Force Member ("TFM") comments were:
 - i. TFM Petouhoff suggested that the recommendations be put in the staff report for the amendments.
 - ii. TFM Graham asked what the new date of termination would be.
 - iii. TFM Radulavich suggested that rather than ask for an extension not to exceed four months, that a date certain be provided, such as December 2007.

- iv. TFM Petouhoff added that the recommendation be for the end of the calendar year.
 - c. Motion to recommend the amendments as revised was made by TFM Seleznow, and seconded by TFM Heinberg. Motion passed by unanimous vote.
 - d. Marisa Arrona stated that the action plan would then be due by October 2007, in order to go to the Public Works Committee and proceed to the full Council for a vote.
 - e. Kimberly Jones reminded the TF that the bylaws will have to be amended to conform to the amended resolution.
- 5. City of Oakland Uses and Sources of Oil/CO2 – Report from Public Works Agency.
 - a. Scott Wentworth of the Public Works Agency (“PWA”) made a report to supplement the information provided in the May 3, 2007 meeting, to respond the TFM questions and requests. His report provided additional information about refineries, but there was no other information he could provide at the time. His report did convert CO2 gases to gallons of petroleum. Questions were either outside of the purview of his work or under investigation by his department. He also stated that ICLEI has information on petroleum, but it would be an ongoing effort to find that information.
 - b. TFM comments were:
 - i. TFM Graham asked if there were attempts to capture Port information also, and if that would require additional rows on a chart to show that information.
 - ii. TFM Petouhoff asked whether the report contained information on petroleum uses that are non-energy, or embedded oil, such as plastic bags, asphalt, concrete, miles traveled for consumer products.
 - iii. TFM Lutz stated that this road of inquiry should be approached carefully.
 - iv. TFM Heinberg stated that embedded oil would need to be considered if discussing petroleum reduction.
 - v. TFM Radulavich stated that there would be a need for consistent methodology in approaching this issue, both internally and in terms of other jurisdictions.
 - vi. Scott Wentworth told the TF that the ICLEI figures are consistent with 11 cities in the Bay Area, other than San Francisco, so there is at least regional consistency.
 - vii. TFM Graham suggested the formation of a subcommittee to establish a baseline understanding of what other jurisdictions are doing.
 - viii. TFM Register asked what the comparison is between petroleum burned and embedded petroleum.
 - ix. TFM Heinberg stated that the amount of petroleum used in materials is about 12%.
 - x. Open discussion about emission allocation, embedded oil, idling, city accountability for transportation and the scope of city control.

At this point, TFM members Richard Register and Tom Radulavich introduced themselves.

- xi. TFM Petouhoff asked about the Plastic Bag Ordinance to be considered by Council.
- xii. Marisa Arrona stated that the proposed Ordinance has been moved to the June 26 Public Works Committee meeting, but it doesn’t deal with the issue of embedded oil. She stated there was a need for clarification.
- xiii. TFM Radulavich stated it is difficult to determine the amount of petroleum used in the manufacture of plastic or biodegradable products.
- xiv. TFM Heinberg reminded the TF that its mandate is to examine petroleum reduction. Embedded oil in plastic is difficult to determine. However, it is easier to ascertain figures for asphalt and roads.

- xv. The TF instructions to staff were to provide:
 - Information on highway-related transportation fuels.
 - Information on Port-related transportation fuels.
 - Non-fuel uses of asphalt in road building and maintenance.
 - The quantity of asphalt and concrete that goes into Oakland roads annually.

The Green Economy Report was pushed back to later in the Agenda by consensus of the TF.

6. Ad Hoc Group Report on Scope and Process

- a. This report covered the scope, principles, metrics, timeline, and working groups.
 - i. TFM Graham pointed out that according to TFM Seleznow's timeline, the letter to other groups should go out next month.
 - ii. TFM Petouhoff stated that there are three types of meetings, which included a new category: public outreach meetings
 - iii. TFM Shah stated that the report followed the model of Portland and Sweden.
 - iv. Open discussion among TFM which included concern regarding metrics, targets, and social justice.
 - v. TFM Petouhoff suggested that "environmental justice impacts" should be added where appropriate for metrics; and that targets should be adopted, and provisions should be made in the action plan for targets.
 - vi. TFM Heinberg stated that a 2.5% reduction annually would be appropriate.
 - vii. It was suggested that a framework with targets should be set up or the rest of the mandate won't be achieved
 - viii. TFM Graham suggested that the 2.5% target should be considered, but she wanted to see analytics to substantiate the recommendation.
 - ix. TFM Petouhoff stated that there should be factual quantitative rationales for target setting.
 - x. TFM Radulavich listed concerns, which included:
 - 1. policy changes,
 - 2. standards and practices,
 - 3. hearing from the City of Oakland,
 - 4. what to tell the City to do and how to know if the City has complied.
 - xi. TFM Kim stated that the challenge is in what can be recommended and what the City can implement, but that he wanted to establish targets as a category.
 - xii. TFM Register stated that an educational campaign is needed where a declaration of emergency or priority would be stated.
 - xiii. TFM Shah suggested that an ad hoc group generate targets.
 - xiv. TFM Lutz suggested that the TF stick with 2.5% as a recommended target.
 - xv. TFM Radulavich stated that there are state-imposed targets for reduction; the TF should be cognizant of these CO2 emissions reductions targets.
 - xvi. TFM Petouhoff suggested that the TF examine the infrastructure, and then advocate for responsible infrastructure policies.
 - xvii. TFM Graham suggested that "intended outputs" should also be included.
- b. There were four public speakers on this item:
 - George Nesbitt
 - Gerald Greene
 - Celeste Ets-Hokin
 - Elizabeth Dougherty, Ph.D

Additional open discussion among TFM members

c. Meeting Types

- i. TFM Lutz suggested that outside groups should be brought in, to give the TF the opportunity to address the community.
- ii. TFM Graham suggested that the wording should be adjusted to reflect the TF's objective.
- iii. TFM Seleznow stated that the TF wants to hear from the community and community experts. Also the form of the recommendations should be considered. There should be an effort to ensure that the public understands the recommendations.
- iv. TFM Graham stated that TFM Seleznow's concept could go under Intended Outputs, but asked whether that suggestion would mean that the public outreach meeting would be deleted.
- v. TFM Petouhoff stated that there is a need to consider the time commitment that many types of meetings would have on the TFM.
- vi. Working Groups:
 1. TFM Radulavich suggested that the working groups be organized according to how the City is organized, which would create different groups than the ones suggested.
 2. TFM Lutz suggested making a recommendation to the City related to negotiating with BART and AC Transit.

Open discussion among TFM members

d. Final Structure of the working groups included the following groups:

- i. Land Use and Infrastructure
- ii. Port of Oakland
- iii. Transportation
- iv. Food, Materials, Water
- v. Somehow "Waste Stream" would be incorporated into the work.
- vi. All working groups would be cross-referenced with the "4 E's":
 - Equity
 - Engagement (Public Outreach)
 - Economy
 - Environmental

Motion to accept working group structure was made by TFM Radulavich, seconded by TFM Heinberg. Motion passed unanimously.

Motion to accept the first half of the report, as amended, was made by TFM Kim, seconded by TFM Radulavich. Motion passed unanimously.

e. Letter to outside organizations

- i. TFM Seleznow didn't want to attach a large number of documents to the letter, which should be sent via email.
- ii. TFM Lutz asked if the letter would be going out in a week, to which the TF agreed by consensus.
- iii. TFM Graham suggested sending Marisa Arrona the potential recipients for the generation of a distribution list.
- iv. Motion to send a letter to an aggregated list of recipients was made by TFM Kim, Seconded by TFM Seleznow. Motion passed unanimously.

- 7. Green Economy Task Force Report**
 - a.** See attached report, Agenda Item 6.
- 8. Public Meeting Training/Presentation**
 - a.** See attached power point presentation, Agenda Item 9.
- 9. Future Agenda Items**
 - a.** The next regularly scheduled meeting is Thursday, June 21, 2007.
 - b.** Per the TFM discussion at the April 5, 2007 meeting, wherein Parin Shah and Ian Kim were elected as Interim Chair and Vice-Chair, respectively, with the understanding that the TF would hold another election for these positions at a later meeting, the election of Chair and Vice-Chair will take place at the next meeting.
 - b.** The TF requested a Staff Report (Informational Only) regarding the quantity of Regular Asphalt versus Rubberized Asphalt installed by the City of Oakland in roads and public rights-of-way in the past five years.
 - c.** Discussion of Methodology and Metrics regarding the 'Four E's' (Environmental Enhancement, Economic Prosperity, Social Equity, and Engagement (Public Outreach)) to be used by the Task Force and the Working Groups.
 - d.** Presentation by Ian Kim regarding Green Jobs and Eco-Equity.
 - e.** Status Report from each Working Group.
 - f.** Report and Recommendation regarding the proposed Plastic Bag Ban Ordinance co-sponsored by Councilmembers Nancy Nadel and Jean Quan, which will be heard at the June 26th Public Works Committee meeting.
- 10. Announcements.**
 - a.** Any and all agenda items and their supporting documentation must be submitted to Marisa Arrona 10 days prior to the meeting for the timely creation and posting of the agenda packet.
 - b.** Councilmember Kernighan filled the District 2 vacant seat by appointing Dr. Louise Bedsworth, who will be a valuable addition to the OIO. Dr. Bedsworth was just appointed last week and her travel schedule prevented her from attending tonight's meeting.
 - c.** This meeting is Kimberly Jones' last since she is returning to New York to complete her fellowship program and studies for a Masters degree in Public Administration.
- 11. Adjournment at 9:55 pm**