
Attachment D: Findings for Approval

This proposal meets the required findings under Section 17.XX.060 (E) Design Review Criteria pursuant to the Kaiser Permanente Oakland Medical Center (KX) Zone Regulations of the Oakland Municipal Code, as set forth below and elsewhere in the Staff Report and record. Required findings are shown in bold type; explanations as to why these findings can be made are shown in normal type.

SECTION 17.XX.060(E) – DESIGN REVIEW CRITERIA:

- 1. That the proposal will help achieve or maintain a group of facilities which are well related to one another and which, when taken together, will result in a well-composed design, with consideration given to site, landscape, bulk, height, arrangement, texture, materials, colors, and appurtenances; the relation of these factors to other facilities in the vicinity; and the relation of the proposal to the total setting as seen from key points in the surrounding area. Only elements of design which have some significant relationship to outside appearance shall be considered.**

The design of the proposed Phase 2 Hospital and its associated buildings, parking garage and central utility plant will relate well to the surrounding area in setting, scale, bulk, height, materials and textures. The site plan provides for a 3 to 4-story podium base with a 12-story tower element for the Hospital. The Hospital podium base varies in height and setback from the street edge, particularly along MacArthur. The Hospital and its associated buildings, parking garage and central utility plant are part of a logically and cohesively planned new Oakland Medical Center Master Plan for the surrounding area, and are consistent with the scale, bulk and height requirements anticipated under that Master Plan. These buildings will also complement the surrounding Broadway corridor in terms of setting, scale, bulk, height, materials and textures because it will help to create a clear and cohesive sense of campus, it will be adjacent to and involve Mosswood Park as part of the campus identity, and will facilitate neighborhood revitalization and improve the neighborhood aesthetics in the area of the Medical Center through the creation of a contemporary, architecturally integrated Medical Center.

- 2. That the proposed design will be of a quality and character which harmonizes with, and serves to protect the value of, private and public investments in the area.**

The Phase 2 design is consistent with the design requirements defined in the Oakland Medical Center Master Plan. That Master Plan has been found to facilitate neighborhood revitalization and to improve the neighborhood aesthetics in the area of the Medical Center through the creation of a contemporary, architecturally integrated new Medical Center. Further, modifications included in this Phase 2 design have substantially improved the Piedmont edge of the campus over that anticipated under the Master Plan, without compromising the aesthetics of the other edges of the campus. These improvements include a re-designed access to the loading dock so that trucks will no longer enter the site from Piedmont but will instead access the site from Broadway; relocating the mobile tech docks to a below-grade site; relocating the oxygen storage tank to an area behind the CUP and next to the I-580 overpass; providing a wider landscaped buffer between the CUP and

Piedmont Avenue; and screening the Emergency Department and ambulance drop-off from the surrounding neighborhood with a “green” screen wall and landscaping.

3. **That the proposed design conforms in all significant respects with the Oakland General Plan and with any applicable district plan or development control map which has been adopted by the City Council.**

Oakland General Plan: On June 20, 2006 the Oakland City Council approved an amendment to the Land Use Diagram of the General Plan that applied the *Institutional* land use classification to all portions of the Kaiser Permanente Oakland Medical Center (OMC) campus, including the Phase 2 site. The purpose of this amendment was to establish a clear and consistent delineation of the OMC on the General Plan Land Use Diagram. The proposed Phase 2 Hospital and its associated buildings, parking garage and central utility plant design conforms in all significant respects with the Land Use and Transportation Element (LUTE) of the Oakland General Plan (formerly Oakland Comprehensive Plan) as amended for the “Institutional” land use designation, which is intended to “*create, maintain and enhance an area that is appropriate for health services and medical uses*”. The Phase 2 project is also consistent with other General Plan policies, including:

- The maximum permitted floor-area ratio (FAR) in the Institutional land use category is 8.0, whereas the Phase 2 project FAR is approximately 3.32 (1,056,000 square feet on a 3.7-acre site).
- The General plan indicates that “appropriate development standards that reflect the nature of the institutional facility and contain appropriate standards to address edge conditions adjacent to residential areas, and the need for expansion space, are all important factors that will be address by zoning.” The Phase 2 project design is consistent with those KX zoning regulations specifically intended to address the nature of the facility and its edge conditions.
- Health Care, Medical Service, and Administrative Activities are all uses that are proposed within the Phase 2 project and which conform to the *Institutional* land use classification.

Kaiser OMC Master Plan, Guiding Principles: On June 13, 2006 the *Kaiser Oakland Medical Center Master Plan* was approved by the Oakland City Council/Redevelopment Agency. The Master Plan is intended to guide the phased replacement of the existing OMC with an expanded and improved medical center campus. The Master Plan includes Principles that are to be implemented and applied to each phase of development as they proceed through the Design Review process. The design of the Phase 2 Hospital and its associated buildings, parking garage and central utility plant conforms in all significant respects with the Principles of the Master Plan, as discussed below.

Principle 1.1: Create an architecturally integrated campus. The Phase 2 design is part of an architecturally integrated campus. The architecture and design elements of Phase 2 relate well in terms of building design, materials, landscaping, lighting and signage to the Phase 1 Broadway Medical Office Building. These Phase 2 buildings further establish a coherent street edge along Broadway and MacArthur Boulevard. The Phase 2 buildings will enhance the area and provide a continuation of a new attractive campus appropriate to a respected institution in the City.

Principle 1.2: Buildings should be attractive and well designed and their form, massing, and height should respect the adjoining neighborhoods in terms of size and scale while some flexibility should generally be employed to accommodate necessary medical functions. The Phase 2 buildings are attractive and well designed, and their form, massing, and height respect the adjoining neighborhoods in terms of size and scale. The Phase 2 design is consistent with the overall campus massing concept of locating the most intense activities and concentrated building massing in the center of the campus near the intersection of Broadway and MacArthur.

Principle 1.3: Some flexibility in the future building massing may be required given evolving and varied healthcare demands, while balancing good urban design principles and seeking to minimize impacts on the adjacent neighborhoods. Some flexibility in the Hospital's building massing has been utilized to meet evolving and varied healthcare demands, while balancing good urban design principles and minimizing impacts on the adjacent neighborhoods. The design of this new hospital building is first and foremost driven by internal hospital programming needs, and the entire hospital and its supporting facilities must be fit onto a fairly small, 7.3-acre site. The result is a building that, for the most part, is efficiently box-like in shape and unavoidably quite massive in size. However, the design successfully integrates many good urban design principles, complies with all of the design requirements of the Master Plan; and responds well to the comments and concerns of their neighbors as expressed through the community workshop process. The Phase 2 design employs architectural design elements such as articulation, alternating color schemes and varying materials in order to help break down its scale. The Phase 2 building designs are in accordance with Kaiser Permanente's integrated model of health care delivery. These new buildings will allow Kaiser to provide uninterrupted operation of service, minimize departmental moves and maintain the continuity of care at the Medical Center during construction.

Principle 2.1: Create street fronts that promote pedestrian activity. Major entrances to the Phase 2 Hospital are located along both Broadway and MacArthur, with the MacArthur entrance being the primary pedestrian entry and the Broadway entrance being the primary vehicular entry. The Landscaping Plan includes several landscape features that help to create a pleasant pedestrian experience in and around the entire Phase 2 site. The internal programming of the Hospital also strives to use the majority of the ground floor space for pedestrian-oriented, hospital-related uses that are capable of activating the street front. A key example is the location of the cafeteria at the corner of Broadway and MacArthur. The Phase 2 building utilizes setbacks to promote the streetscape activities and provide public open space along MacArthur Boulevard and Piedmont Avenue.

Principle 2.2: Create a walkable environment. Sidewalks that surround the Phase 2 site on Broadway, MacArthur and Piedmont are generous in width, at a minimum of 10 feet. Pedestrian-oriented outdoor spaces on the ground floor include a prominent public space at the MacArthur/Piedmont corner, the main pedestrian entrance across from Howe Street, a landscaped pedestrian pathway that traverses from Piedmont Avenue through the site and ultimately connecting to Mosswood Park,

and a landscaped edge along Piedmont from MacArthur to Broadway. Additionally, the building materials emphasize storefront glazing along the street level. Open space and sidewalks around the Phase 2 site provide for safe pedestrian environments. Street furniture, pedestrian improvements, landscaping and other site amenities are accommodated along Broadway, Piedmont and MacArthur.

Principle 3.1: The pedestrian and vehicular circulation plan should address the Oakland Medical Center as a single unit. As part of a separate Small Project Design Review process, Kaiser is preparing a clear and comprehensive campus sign and way-finding master plan. The results of this signage master plan will be implemented on the Phase 2 site.

Principle 3.2: Minimize vehicular conflicts with pedestrians. The streetscape plan creates a walkable and safe pedestrian environment along the building and campus edges. Enhanced crosswalks (special paving or striping) are indicated at major intersections for pedestrian safety. Curb cuts are minimized to three entrance on Broadway (including the service access immediately adjacent to the I-580 overpass), no vehicular entrances along MacArthur, and two vehicular entrances (including the ambulance entrance) from Piedmont. Vehicular drop off zones, shuttle stops and bus stops are generally separated from pedestrian activity, particularly along MacArthur. The main Hospital entrance provides a drop-off and pick-up area that is outside of the main parking garage circulation path to minimize traffic conflicts.

In response to concerns expressed by neighbors, the design for the various campus access points has been modified from that shown in the Master Plan. These modifications include relocating the truck driveway from Piedmont Avenue to Broadway, and eliminating direct from the parking garage back to Piedmont Avenue. The design for campus access now includes a total of five driveways:

- The first driveway is a service drive located off Broadway immediately north of the I-580 overpass and behind the parking garage. It is for vehicles servicing the CUP, oxygen tank and the underground loading dock only.
- The second driveway is off Broadway, approximately 40 feet north of the service drive and provides primary access to the parking garage. It will be signalized and provide both inbound and outbound access with both right turns and left turns on arrows allowed.
- A third driveway off Broadway will provide signalized access to the Main Entrance. The Main Entrance driveway is located about 200 feet north of the parking garage driveway on Broadway. It serves as inbound and outbound access for visitors using the pick-up/drop-off and patient discharge area of the hospital. It also serves as an in-bound entrance only to the parking garage (once a visitor enters the parking garage, they may only exit from the southern parking garage driveway on Broadway).
- The fourth driveway is an ambulance-only drive off of Piedmont Avenue.

- The fifth driveway provides public access to the Emergency Department off of Piedmont Avenue. This driveway provides a continuation as an in-bound entrance only to the parking garage (once a visitor enters the parking garage, they may only exit from the parking garage driveway on Broadway).

This vehicular access plan is superior to the Master Plan's original access scheme in that it removes larger service vehicles from Piedmont Avenue, it separates ambulance and public access to the Emergency Department, and it separates the primary pedestrian and drop-off entrance from the primary garage entry.

Principle 3.3: When permitted, provide pedestrian bridges that support Kaiser's integrated model of care by linking buildings where medical care is delivered. Whereas the Master Plan enabled construction of two pedestrian sky-bridges as part of the Phase 2 site, only one pedestrian sky-bridge will be constructed, connecting across Broadway from the parking garage to the existing Mosswood Medical Office Building parallel to the I-580 overpass. This pedestrian bridge is consistent with the Master Plan. A second skybridge connection between the parking garage and the Hospital was included in the original Master Plan, but the current design instead makes the pedestrian connection between the parking garage and the hospital at ground level beneath a trellis or canopy. This ground-level pedestrian connection is generally superior to a skybridge in regard to the pedestrian environment as hospital visitors and staff will instead walk at ground level to get to various destinations within the campus, helping to enliven the number of pedestrians on the campus sidewalks.

Principle 4.2: Create inviting outdoor spaces. Outdoor spaces included in Phase 2 include a landscaped plaza area between the Main Entrance/Emergency Department and the parking garage/CUP building; a landscaped pedestrian pathway that traverses from Piedmont Avenue through the site and ultimately connecting to Mosswood Park; a landscaped edge along Piedmont from MacArthur to Broadway; a small outdoor courtyard at the corner of MacArthur and Piedmont; a pedestrian plaza with street trees and wide sidewalks along the MacArthur frontage; and two open courtyards within the hospital building. New street trees and other landscaping will also be planted along the Broadway, MacArthur and Piedmont street frontages, and in the Broadway and MacArthur center medians.

Principle 5.1: Adequate, appropriately located and signed parking, loading and service areas should be provided. The Phase 2 parking garage is located along Broadway near the I-580 overpass, consistent with the Master Plan. The parking garage will contain 1,216 parking spaces, also consistent with the requirements of the Master Plan and the analysis provided in the OMC Master Plan EIR. The loading dock for the Hospital is located below ground to minimize noise and aesthetic impacts, and service access to the loading dock will enter the site from Broadway rather than from Piedmont (as had been anticipated under the Master Plan). The modified access to the loading dock is in direct response to concerns expressed by the neighbors, and substantially improves the Piedmont edge without compromising the aesthetics of the other edges of the campus.

Principle 5.2: Parking garages should respect the adjoining neighborhoods in terms of size and scale, while some flexibility should generally be acknowledged in order to accommodate necessary parking demands. The height of the Phase 2 parking garage, at eight stories above grade and two floors below grade, is consistent with the approved Master Plan and zoning requirements. It is located along Broadway near the I-580 overpass, on the far side of the campus and away from the adjacent Piedmont residential neighborhood. The parking garage does have architecturally interesting elements such as modulated horizontal openings, vertical design elements and vine screens to help breakdown its scale.

Principle 6.1: Sustainable design elements and features should be incorporated. The Phase 2 design incorporates numerous elements from “Green Guidelines for Health Care”.¹ A number of “Green Guide” design strategies are required as EIR mitigation measures and Master Plan policies, and many other “Green Guide” strategies are incorporated into the proposed design. Examples include, but are not limited to the use of native plants in all landscaping areas, using landscape and open spaces for filtration of storm water, providing an easily accessible area that serves the entire building and is dedicated to the collection and storage of materials for recycling, providing patients, staff, and visitors with accessible indoor and outdoor places of respite, and providing preferred parking for low-emitting and fuel-efficient vehicles.

Kaiser OMC Master Plan, Phase 2 Design Guidelines: Under the *Kaiser Oakland Medical Center Master Plan*, each sub-district within the OMC campus is to have unique design elements that address specific location issues. The proposed Phase 2 Hospital and its associated buildings, parking garage and central utility plant design also conforms in all significant respects with the Master Plan’s specific design guidelines for the Phase 2 site, as discussed below.

1. New construction in the Phase 2 site is proposed at 1,056,000 square feet, which exceeds the maximum limit established in the Master Plan (which is 1,017,000 square feet) by approximately 39,000 square feet, or by approximately 3.7%. Although the square footage is slightly greater than anticipated under the Master Plan, the design and square footage significantly conforms to the intent of the Master Plan. In order to qualify for more than 957,000 square feet of building space, a schematic development plan for Phase 3 must be submitted for review by the City Planning Commission prior to occupancy of the Phase 2 parking garage (consistent with Master Plan Policy A2).
2. The proposed central utility plant (CUP) is located near the freeway to minimize impacts on the surrounding neighborhood (consistent with Master Plan Guideline

¹ The *Green Guide for Health Care Version 2.2 (2007)* is the health care sector’s quantifiable sustainable design toolkit integrating enhanced environmental and health principles and practices into the planning, design, construction, operations and maintenance of health care facilities. It is a document created through a committee process. The Committee is convened by the Center for Maximum Potential Building Systems (a non-profit design firm), with a large number of Sponsors and Partners, including Kaiser Permanente.

- 7.3.1). Additionally, the site plan enables a large landscaped buffer between the CUP and the Piedmont Avenue neighborhood.
3. The large parking structure is located near the freeway (consistent with Master Plan Guideline 7.3.2). However, the current design proposal deviates from the Master Plan's guidelines in two respects. First, the proposed Phase 2 design makes the pedestrian connection between the parking garage and the hospital at ground level beneath a trellis or canopy, instead of constructing an overhead skybridge. Second, it proposes various modifications to previously proposed campus access points, primarily in response to concerns expressed by neighbors. These access modifications include eliminating direct access from the parking garage to Piedmont Avenue and improving the traffic flow at garage entrances. These design modification are superior to the Master Plan's original access scheme, while significantly conforming to the intent of the Master Plan.
 4. The hospital design includes a podium with a tower element (consistent with Master Plan Guideline 7.3.3). The site plan provides for a 3 to 4-story podium base with a 12-story tower element. The Hospital podium base varies in height and setback from the street edge, particularly along MacArthur.
 5. The tower element is set back from Broadway to reduce shadows on Mosswood Park (consistent with Master Plan Guideline 7.3.4). The tower is sited approximately mid-block, 150 feet back from Broadway as specifically required under the EIR and the Master Plan.
 6. Active type uses are provided at the ground level of the Hospital building along Broadway and MacArthur, and at the MacArthur/Piedmont corner (consistent with Master Plan Guideline 7.3.5). A number of hospital-program uses are indicated at the ground level, including a cafeteria at the Broadway/ MacArthur corner and an active outdoor public space at the MacArthur/Piedmont corner. Other hospital uses that activate the street include administrative offices, waiting lounges, health education, conference rooms and circulation corridors, which are placed around the building at the street edge. Outdoor garden seating areas are provided at each of the main corners on MacArthur. While no pedestrian-oriented or street-activating types of uses are proposed within the large parking structure on Broadway, the Master Plan does not include any such requirement for this parking garage.
 7. A pedestrian path connects Piedmont Avenue to Mosswood Park through the Hospital site (consistent with Master Plan Guideline 7.3.6). The landscape plan provides a strong pedestrian link through the center of the site, connecting Piedmont Avenue to Mosswood Park. A substantial landscaped buffer area is also provided at the Emergency Department entrance off of Piedmont to screen some of the adjacent hospital facilities. The landscaped pedestrian pathway connects via a new, signalized pedestrian crossing of Broadway to Mosswood Park.
 8. Public improvements are provided along lower Piedmont Avenue between West MacArthur Boulevard and Broadway (consistent with Master Plan Guideline

7.3.7). These improvements include 28 new street trees (36-inch box) within the off-site right-of-way of both Broadway and Piedmont, south of the I-580 overpass.

4. **That any proposed retaining wall is consistent with the overall building and site design and respects the natural landscape and topography of the site and surrounding areas, and that the retaining wall is responsive to human scale, avoiding large, blank, uninterrupted or un-designed vertical surfaces.**

The landscaped buffer area provided adjacent to the CUP provides a landscaping screen for the adjacent Piedmont neighborhood and an attractive street edge along this portion of lower Piedmont Avenue. This landscaped area includes a series of short retaining walls and ramps to accommodate the grade change from the street edge to the campus. The retaining walls are less than 3 feet in height as they step up this grade and are well light, attractively designed and provide a safe and pleasant pedestrian environment along this portion of the campus.