

Project Name: Kaiser Permanente Hospital, Design Review

Location: The full block between **Broadway and Piedmont Avenue, and between I-580 and West MacArthur Boulevard**

Assessors Parcels: 009-0732-011-03, 009-0732-001-02, 012-0940-001-03

Proposal: Demolition of all existing structures and construction of a new, approximately 1.1 million square foot hospital/outpatient services building, an associated parking structure and central utility plant.

Prior planning approvals for this project include EIR certification, a General Plan amendment and Redevelopment Plan amendment approval on June 27, 2006; and Rezoning and Master Plan approval on July 18, 2006. The proposed new hospital is the 2nd phase of the approved Kaiser Permanente Oakland Medical Center Master Plan.

Applicant: Kaiser Permanente, Kaiser Foundation Health Plan
Michael Lane, Project Director, Kaiser Permanente (510) 987-2373

Owner: Kaiser Permanente

Case File Number: DR07496

Planning Permits Required: Major Design Review

General Plan: Institutional

Zoning: KX: Kaiser Permanente Oakland Medical Center Zone

Historic Status: No historic resources identified on the project site

Environmental Determination: An EIR for the Kaiser Permanente OMC Master Plan was prepared by the City of Oakland as the Lead Agency. That EIR was certified by the Oakland Planning Commission on June 6, 2006 and its certification confirmed by the City Council on June 27, 2006. The current project is generally consistent with that analyzed in the Master Plan EIR. No additional environmental review is required

City Council District: 3, south of MacArthur

Action to be Taken: Solicit public and Committee comments on site plan and design. No decisions on the project will be made at this hearing

For further information: Contact: **Scott Gregory**, contract planner to the City at 510-535-6690, or by email at kaiser@lamphier-gregory.com

SUMMARY

This report provides the Design Review Committee with background information and a status report of current design efforts regarding Design Review for Phase 2 of the Kaiser Oakland Medical Center (OMC) Master Plan – the proposed new Kaiser Permanente Hospital and Outpatient Services Building. The purpose of this first Design Review Committee meeting is for preliminary review of the project. This first meeting provides the project design team an opportunity to present their conceptual design materials to the Committee, and to solicit public and Design Review Committee comments on those materials. The focus of this first review is to discuss and obtain feedback on the broader site planning issues, landscape imagery and architectural/design approach. A future meeting (or meetings) will be held to review the more detailed and final building design proposal.

Beginning in September, Kaiser has held a series of community workshops intended to discuss and seek community consensus on a number of design considerations for the hospital. There are a number of site planning and design issues that have been proposed by Kaiser and discussed at the workshops. It would be valuable for staff and for Kaiser's design team to have the Committee consider these issues, and offer preliminary comments that may assist and guide Kaiser's on-going design efforts.

Prior certifications and planning approvals pursuant to the Kaiser Oakland Medical Center Master Plan include:

- Planning Commission recommendation of approval of the Master Plan, its EIR and other requested entitlements, with modifications and conditions, on June 6, 2007
- City Council certification of the Kaiser Oakland Medical Center Master Plan EIR, and approval of a General Plan Amendment and Redevelopment Plan Amendment on June 27, 2006
- City Council approval of rezoning and the Kaiser Oakland Medical Center Master Plan on July 18, 2006
- Planning Commission approval of the Glen Echo Creek Restoration Plan on September 6, 2006
- Planning Commission Design Review approval for the Phase I Broadway Medical Office Building and parking garage on November 1, 2006.

PHASE 2 SITE AND SURROUNDING AREA

Hospital and Outpatient Services Building Site

The Phase 2 Hospital and Outpatient Services Building site is approximately 7.3 acres and includes the full block between Broadway and Piedmont Avenue, and between I-580 and West MacArthur Boulevard. It is the current site of the M/B Center, another small retail center and an apartment building, all of which are now owned by Kaiser Permanente. Kaiser's medical and administrative office space occupies the existing approximately 245,000 square foot tower which sits atop the M/B Center. The rooftop of the M/B Center provides 1,156 surface parking spaces for Kaiser's staff, patients and visitors. With last summers Master Plan approvals, the site now has a General Plan designation of Institutional, and is zoned KX: Kaiser Oakland Medical Center.

Surrounding Area

Directly west of the Hospital site and south of MacArthur Boulevard is the 11-acre Mosswood Park, a community park that provides open space area and recreational facilities. Mosswood Park is located at the southwest corner of Broadway and West MacArthur Boulevard. Kaiser Permanente's existing 12-story Mosswood Medical Services Building abuts the southeast corner of the park and fronts onto Broadway.

Northwest of the site, on the northwest corner of Broadway and MacArthur, is the location of Kaiser's Phase I Medical Office Building and parking garage, which is currently under construction. Once complete, those Kaiser facilities currently located in the M/B Center tower will be relocated to this new building.

Directly north of the site, on the opposite side of MacArthur Boulevard is the current Kaiser Permanente hospital. Pursuant to the approved Master Plan, once the proposed new hospital is constructed, those facilities currently located in the existing hospital will be relocated to the new hospital, and the existing hospital will be taken down.

Northeast of the site on the northeast corner of Piedmont and MacArthur, is a gas station and auto repair shop. North of that is Kaiser's Howe and Piedmont Medical Office Buildings and parking garage. Pursuant to the approved Master Plan, these existing Kaiser facilities will remain.

East of the Hospital site and south of MacArthur Boulevard is the Richmond neighborhood, a primarily single family residential neighborhood with homes along streets that are perpendicular to Piedmont Avenue. Directly across Piedmont Avenue is an apartment building, a mortuary and an auto repair shop.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The Kaiser Oakland Medical Center Master Plan (Master Plan) is intended to guide the phased replacement of the existing Oakland Medical Center (OMC) with an expanded and improved medical center campus of approximately 1.78 million square feet on approximately 20.6 acres. The new Oakland Medical Center is expected to be completed by approximately year 2020. The OMC will continue to provide uninterrupted medical service on-site during construction and implementation of the Master Plan. The OMC Master Plan provides a "development blueprint" for the phased redevelopment and construction of the Center.

Phase 1 of the Master Plan, the Broadway Medical Office Building and parking garage, is currently under construction.

Phase 2 – Hospital and Outpatient Services Building

Phase 2 of the Master Plan provides for a new Hospital and Outpatient Services Building and its associated parking structure. The Master Plan provides for the general uses, height limits, mass and bulk of the new hospital building. Consistent with the Master Plan, new construction is proposed to include the new replacement hospital, outpatient services, a new central utility plant and a structured parking garage. Specifics of the new construction include:

- A new building with a 4-story podium base (approximately 68 feet tall), and a nursing tower generally centered on the podium's north-south axis. The tower would measure 210 feet in height from grade (with an additional 30 feet for rooftop equipment and screening), stepped back from Broadway by approximately 150 feet. The building would be a maximum of 1,107,000 square feet in size.¹ An interstitial floor of strictly mechanical space is excluded from the maximum building size.
 - The hospital portion of the building would be approximately 700,000 square feet in size and contain 346 in-patient hospital beds. Its construction must comply with stringent Office of Statewide Health Planning and Development (OSHPD) construction standards, which are regulated and enforced by the state.
 - The outpatient services portion of the building would be approximately 407,000 square feet in size and include outpatient medical office and service space. The outpatient service portion of the building is not an OSHPD facility, and its construction would comply with City of Oakland building code standards.
- An approximately 60,000 square foot central utility plant (CUP)
- A new parking garage containing up to 1,216 parking spaces. The parking garage is proposed at eight stories above grade and two floors below grade.

Construction of Phase 2 as described would enable Kaiser to meet current state seismic safety requirements for hospitals. Kaiser would move existing hospital and medical office uses that currently occupy the existing hospital, to this new site. Final design of the Phase 2 Hospital and Outpatient Services Building and its associated parking garage is to be determined pursuant to this Design Review process.

KAISER'S PUBLIC WORKSHOP PROCESS and PRELIMINARY DESIGN RESPONSES

Public Workshops

Kaiser's representatives have held a series of public workshops intended to inform the community about their plans for the Phase 2 Hospital and Outpatient Services Building and associated structures and improvements, and to solicit community input.² Three public workshops

¹ The new Replacement Hospital Building is programmed in the Master Plan up to a maximum of 957,000 square feet in size. An additional 60,000 square feet of space may be added to this building (to a maximum of 1,107,000 square feet) provided that Kaiser submit a schematic development plan that delineates the development program for Phase 3. In order to qualify for this option, the schematic development plan for Phase 3 must be submitted for review by the City Planning Commission prior to occupancy of the Phase 2 parking garage.

² Kaiser's PowerPoint presentations from Workshops #1, #2 and #3, and summaries of comments from each of these meetings are available for review on the City's web site at:
http://www.oaklandnet.com/government/ceda/revised/planningzoning/MajorProjectsSection/kaiser_revie

were held on September 17th, October 1st and October 22nd at the Mosswood Recreation Center. At each workshop, Michael Lane of Kaiser Permanente and Jeffrey Bailey of NBBJ Architects presented various information related to preliminary proposals for the layout, site access, and design parameters of the new hospital site. At the third public meeting, Kaiser's design team presented possible design solutions intended to address the concerns expressed by the community at the first and second workshops. Peter Bluhon facilitated community discussions, and a recorder wrote comments and questions on wall charts. Summary reports from each of the first three workshops are included as **Attachment A** to this staff report.

A fourth community workshop was held on December 4th, primarily focused on issues of building design and architecture. Given the timing of this workshop, the summary report was not available for inclusion in this staff report. However, key comments from that meeting included:

- General appreciation of the thoughtful process by which the building is being designed
- Concern over building materials, particularly the use of cement plaster on the podium
- Maximization of green technologies and meeting Green Building Practices for Health Care (hospital version of LEED)
- Continuing dialogue over traffic concerns

Overview of Community Concerns, and Kaiser's Proposed Design Responses

Location of Accessory Hospital Functions

Under Kaiser's preliminary site plan proposal, many of the hospital's accessory functions and facilities were all located along lower Piedmont Avenue, between MacArthur and the I-580 overpass. These facilities included the Emergency Department/ambulance drop-off, the central utility plant (CUP), a large oxygen storage tank, mobile tech unit parking bays, and access to the truck loading dock.

Many of the workshop participants are residents of the adjacent Richmond neighborhood east of Piedmont. These neighbors expressed significant dissatisfaction with Kaiser's preliminary site plan, feeling that their neighborhood on lower Piedmont had been treated as a utilitarian back alley for the hospital.

Kaiser's Preliminary Design Response: Kaiser's proposed design responses to these concerns are shown in the attached Preliminary Design Review submittal, **Attachment B**, and include the following:

1. The loading dock for the hospital has always been proposed to be located underground, below the hospital building. Access to the loading dock has now been redesigned so that trucks will no longer enter the site from Piedmont, but will instead access the site from Broadway. The service dock entry will come off of Broadway at

the rear of the parking structure near the I-580 overpass, and enter the below-ground dock from between the parking garage and the CUP.

2. The mobile tech docks, which would have included roll-up doors on Piedmont behind which the mobile equipment would have been stored, have now been relocated to a below-grade site near the loading dock.
3. The oxygen storage tank is an underground facility, but needs to include a protective wall of approximately 12' in height. The tank has been relocated off of the Piedmont frontage, and now is tucked in behind the CUP next to the I-580 overpass.
4. The CUP has remained in its originally proposed location, which is consistent with the Master Plan's guideline for locating it near the freeway to minimize neighborhood impacts. However, with removal of the loading dock access and the oxygen tank, a larger landscaped buffer between the CUP and Piedmont Avenue has been created.
5. Although several options for relocation the Emergency Department (ED) have been considered, the ED has not been moved to another portion of the site. Kaiser has expressed a strong design and safety requirement to separate traffic related to the ED from other main hospital and outpatient traffic flows. Vehicular access to the site directly via MacArthur is limited and problematic. The Master Plan already establishes the main hospital entry as being off of Broadway, and the loading dock access is now also proposed along Broadway, limiting opportunities for additional access from that street. Piedmont Avenue is left as the only other viable alternative access for the ED.
6. The design for the ambulance entrance has been shifted slightly to the north (nearer to MacArthur Boulevard), and a solid wall is now proposed as a noise and light buffer between the ambulance entry and the diagonally adjacent neighborhood.

Landscaping and Streetscape

The OMC Master Plan contains policies and guidelines that call for creating inviting outdoor spaces, including gathering spaces that relate to the public streets, outdoor plazas and courts, substantial new landscape plantings and street trees, and landscape and street furniture along streets and public spaces to encourage pedestrian activity. Comments from participants at Kaiser's workshop series echoed these policies, requesting that Kaiser look to create a more pedestrian friendly streetscape along the hospital's edges. Specific suggestions included better lighting and amenities along lower Piedmont to improve pedestrian safety, a landscaped entry off of MacArthur, a safe and convenient pedestrian connection from Piedmont to Mosswood Park, and using landscaping to screen certain hospital-related accessory structures and facilities.

Kaiser's Preliminary Design Response: Kaiser's proposed design responses to Master Plan policies and community comments, as illustrated in their Conceptual Landscaping Plan (see Attachment B), include the following:

1. A pedestrian plaza with a double row of street trees and a wide sidewalk are proposed along the full MacArthur frontage.
2. A major pedestrian entry to the hospital is proposed across from Howe Street, with a landscaped garden area to signify its location.
3. A small park-like plaza is envisioned at the corner of MacArthur and Piedmont.
4. A substantial landscaped buffer area is planned at the Emergency Department entrance off of Piedmont, screening some of these adjacent hospital facilities. This area would also contain the entrance to a landscaped pedestrian pathway that traverses between the hospital and the CUP/parking garage, ultimately connecting to Mosswood Park. This landscaped area would also continue both north and south as a landscaped edge along Piedmont, from MacArthur to Broadway.
5. At the main hospital entry on Broadway, the drop-off area would contain a landscaped island and entry plaza. Across Broadway and within Mosswood Park, Kaiser has indicated their desire to develop a “gateway/entry feature” at the edge of the park, where the pedestrian crossing from the hospital would connect to the park.
6. New street trees and other landscaping are also proposed along the Broadway frontage, and in the Broadway and MacArthur center medians.

Active Ground Floor Uses

The OMC Master Plan contains policies and guidelines that call for creating street fronts that promote pedestrian activity. Specifically, building entrances should face the street or other publicly accessible courts, buildings along MacArthur Boulevard may utilize setbacks to promote the streetscape activities or to provide public open space, the transparency of buildings along Broadway, MacArthur Boulevard and Piedmont Avenue should be maximized with non-mirror reflective glazing, especially at the ground level, and buildings along Broadway and MacArthur Boulevard and at the MacArthur/Piedmont corner should have ground floor active uses that are visible from the public streets. Comments from participants at Kaiser’s workshops further suggested that Kaiser consider leasing retail space along the ground floor, and that the current retail uses and related pedestrian traffic on upper Piedmont should influence the design of ground floor space on lower Piedmont at the hospital.

Kaiser’s Preliminary Design Response: Kaiser’s proposed design responses to the Master Plan policies and the community comments include the following:

1. Even at over 1 million square feet, Kaiser has indicated that the proposed building is only large enough to accommodate the hospital and outpatient services programmed for this space. Leasing any of this space to outside retail tenants would reduce the amount of building space needed to accommodate the primary medical use of the building.
2. Kaiser’s programming of the internal space, particularly for the outpatient services portions of the building, is not at the point where they can be definitive about the

specific uses that will be located along the street frontage. However, they have committed to using the majority, if not all of the building frontage along MacArthur, at the MacArthur/Piedmont corner, and at the MacArthur/Broadway corner for the following types of hospital-related uses that are capable of activating the street front:

- Cafeteria
- Gift Shop
- Flower Shop
- Waiting Lounges
- Health Education
- Conference Rooms
- Outpatient Pharmacy
- Circulation Corridors along Street Frontage

3. The building materials concepts provided by Kaiser in their preliminary submittal (Attachment B) indicate their intent to use a storefront glazing system along the street level, particularly where the uses listed above are located.

Skybridges

The Master Plan identifies the need for several crossings of public streets to travel between various buildings within the OMC. One pedestrian skybridge over the public right of way on Broadway and adjacent to Highway 580, connecting the existing Mosswood Medical Office Building to the Phase 2 parking structure, is permitted. Another on-site pedestrian bridge connecting the hospital to the parking garage is also permitted.

Kaiser would eventually like to construct another skybridge over MacArthur Boulevard, connecting the new hospital to the Phase 3 site. However, consideration of the need for such a skybridge is not warranted until Phase 3. Therefore, the need for and final design and final location of a potential MacArthur Boulevard skybridge, versus a tunnel or surface street crossing, is to be determined during the Design Review process and pursuant to a Conditional Use Permit for Phase 3. No other skybridge over Broadway shall be permitted. There has been little discussion of skybridges at the community workshops.

1. The design and final location of the permitted Broadway skybridge and the on-site pedestrian bridge connecting the hospital to the parking garage is to be determined during the Design Review process for the current Phase 2. No designs have yet been submitted by Kaiser for this facility.
2. Design Review for this current Phase 2 should also consider means to ensure that a choice of skybridge versus tunnel versus surface street crossings at this location is preserved. Kaiser intends to design and construct the new hospital building in such a manner as to be capable of accommodating a skybridge connection at a potential later date, subject to Design Review for Phase 3. Until then, Kaiser will rely on pedestrian street crossings at the Broadway/MacArthur, MacArthur/Howe and MacArthur/Piedmont intersections for pedestrian access to the new hospital.

Architecture and Building Design

The OMC Master Plan contains policies and guidelines that call for creating an architecturally integrated campus by maintaining unity in building design and materials, relating buildings to each other in scale, and providing a coherent street edge along Broadway, MacArthur Boulevard and Piedmont Avenue. The buildings should work as an ensemble to enhance the area, and should be attractive and well designed. Their form, massing, and height should respect the adjoining neighborhoods in terms of size and scale. The tower element of the new hospital should be set back from Broadway a minimum of 150 feet so as to minimize shading of Mosswood Park and other public open spaces. Buildings should address the streets and employ architectural design elements such as articulation and step-backs in order to help break down their scale. Additional suggestions made by workshop participants included the following:

- The building should not be too square and blocky, but instead should have more angles.
- Long sides of the building should particularly be articulated with shapes and shadow lines, not just colored stripes, to create rhythm.
- Use a variety of materials and avoid mirror glass.
- Make the building look more delicate, not so heavy
- Integrate and retain classic look and style of the existing area.
- Consider ecological technologies and approaches in the design, use LEED standards for energy efficiency.
- Use high quality materials for the whole podium, not just the ground floor. Stucco or cement plaster should not be used because it will become dirty from air pollution.
- The general consensus of participants was that the building should be an interesting, creative, and beautiful design.

Kaiser's Preliminary Design Response: Kaiser's has responded to Master Plan policies and community comments by articulating their design team's approach to the architectural design of the building. This approach illustrates, in a conceptual manner, how their final design will be the result of an integration of various factors that influence the building. This comprehensive design approach is explained in Kaiser's Preliminary Design Review Submittal (see **Attachment B** to this staff report), and Kaiser's design team intends to present these concepts to the Committee. Generally, these design concepts include:

1. The design and materials for the Hospital and Outpatient Services Building are intended to relate to the building style and materials used on the Phase 1 Broadway Medical Office Building.
2. The long building façade on MacArthur is broken up by several increasing setbacks incorporated into the podium base. These setbacks generally follow the curve of MacArthur Boulevard as it approaches Piedmont Avenue.
3. The building materials concepts indicate different material palettes for the building, the CUP and the parking garage:
 - The ground floor of the Hospital/Outpatient Services Building is shown as primarily storefront glazing

- The upper floors of the podium are shown as cement plaster with recessed windows
- The nursing tower is shown as a metal panel system with recessed windows and window accent panels
- The CUP is shown with a frosted glass wall on the ground level, with metal screening above
- The parking garage is also shown with a metal screening façade, covered with a “green” screen similar to the Phase 1 parking garage

MASTER PLAN CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The Conditions of Approval required of the Kaiser OMC Master Plan contain a number of design and other requirements that need to be considered as part of the Phase 2 Design Review approvals. The Master Plan’s Conditions of Approval that specifically pertain to the Phase 2 site are itemized in **Attachment C** to this staff report. These conditions are provided for information only, and no staff recommendations have yet been made as to whether these conditions have been met. Compliance with all conditions will be a requirement of final Phase 2 approvals.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION / NEXT STEPS:

Staff recommends that the DRC:

- 1) Open the public hearing on the Kaiser OMC Master Plan, Phase 2 Design Review, and take public comments on the issues.
- 2) Initiate review and comment on the preliminary plans, providing the Committees’ suggestions, recommendations and thoughts on the preliminary design concepts shown.
- 3) Consider whether an additional preliminary design presentation would be beneficial to the Committee, and if so, provide direction to staff as to the types of additional plans, materials and information needed.
- 4) The public hearing on Design Review for this item should remain open.

At such time as Kaiser’s design team has developed a full design submittal, and staff has reviewed the submitted materials and determined them to be complete, staff will bring that submittal to the Committee for a recommendation to the full Commission. We would not expect that to occur sooner than late January or February.

Prepared by:

Scott Gregory
SCOTT GREGORY
Contract Planner

Approved for forwarding to the
City Planning Commission Design Review Committee:

GARY PATTON
Deputy Director of Planning and Zoning

Attachments:

- A. Summary Reports from the three community workshops held by Kaiser
- B. Kaiser's Preliminary Design Review submittal package, including site plans and a bound Concept Plan
- C. OMC Master Plan Conditions of Approval related to the Phase 2 Design Review