

Location:	1111-1199 Pine Street, West Oakland APN 006-0029-002-00
Proposal:	Conversion of the Pacific Coast Canning Company warehouse to 107 warehouse lofts; new construction of 41 live/work façade lofts and 14 courtyard townhouse lofts; and construction of a 242 parking garage*
Applicant:	Alex Waterbury (510) 547-2122
Owner:	PCL Associates, LLC
Case File Number:	PUD 05-014
Planning Permits Required:	Planned Unit Development (Preliminary Development Plan and Final Development Plan), Design Review
General Plan:	Business Mix*
Zoning:	M-30/S-16/S-4 (General Industrial/Industrial-Residential Transition/Design Review Combining zone)*
Environmental Determination:	Final Environmental Impact Report near completion
Historic Status:	A potentially designated historic property (PDHP), ASI contributor of secondary importance (Cb+2+)
Service Delivery District:	West Oakland 1
City Council District:	3
For further information:	Contact case planner Margaret Stanzione at 510 238-4932 or by e-mail at mstanzione@oaklandnet.com

* This project could not be implemented until the General Plan Amendment and Wood Street Zoning District for the Wood Street Development project were approved.

SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to provide preliminary design review comments for a project known as the Pacific Cannery Lofts development that involves the conversion of the existing Pacific Coast Canning Company Warehouse building. Development of the project would be dependant on approval of the Wood Street Zoning District, associated General Plan and Zoning Amendments, and other approvals which has yet to occur. However, the project applicant has requested **preliminary design review** by the DRC at this time in order to be prepared to submit final PDP and FDP documents for the project.

The Pacific Cannery Lofts project would provide 107 warehouse lofts; 41 live/work façade lofts; 14 courtyard townhouse lofts; and the construction of a 242 parking garage. Part of the existing warehouse structure, the Cannery Addition to the south of the main building, will be removed to allow for new development. The proposed development forms part of the Wood Street Development project and would be subject to the approval of the Wood Street Zoning District and associated General Plan and Zoning Amendments.

The proposed project would occur on Development Area 2 within the Wood Street Zoning District. Development Area 2 consists of two parcels. The Oakland Icehouse, on Parcel 1, a two-story concrete building with a basement area, would remain in place and is not part of the Pacific Cannery Lofts development. The proposed project would occur on Parcel 2, a 111,950 square foot site that currently contains the existing Pacific Coast Cannery Warehouse building and a collection of one-story, brick, concrete and steel truss buildings and several concrete loading

dock areas. Within Parcel 2, much of the existing Pacific Coast Cannery Warehouse building would be maintained and renovated for new housing. The other buildings on the site would be removed as part of this development.

The architectural style of the proposed development reflects the industrial character of the buildings that will remain on, and adjoining the site, and in the surrounding area. This is particularly true of the renovated Pacific Coast Cannery Warehouse building. The scale and height of proposed new construction would match that of surrounding structures. The existing Pacific Coast Cannery Warehouse building is approximately 40 feet high. The proposed four-story garage structure for Parcel 2 will be approximately 40 feet high and the façade perimeter loft units will be 45-50 feet high. The proposed three story courtyard townhomes on Parcel 2 will be approximately 35 feet high. The maximum building height for the project noted in the Wood Street Zoning Regulations is 65 feet. The project will be designed in accordance with the Wood Street Zoning Regulations and associated set-back requirements.

The proposed exterior materials for the project would be mainly stucco and glass with sloped roof lines and extended bay window elements. The proposed facade of the renovated two-story Pacific Coast Cannery Warehouse building would consist of large areas of glass windows and decorative spandrels.

THE WOOD STREET DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

The Wood Street Development Project (formerly the Central Station Project) is located in West Oakland on approximately 29.2 acres of largely underdeveloped land between 10th Street to the south, West Grand Avenue to the north, Wood Street to the east, and the I-880 frontage road to the west. The Wood Street Development Project is a mixed-use project is located in an area that was previously considered in the Oakland Army Base Redevelopment Plan. The site is presently designated in the *Land Use and Transportation Element* of the General Plan as “Business Mix” and does not permit residential activity. The Wood Street Development Project will require a General Plan Amendment as well as a Rezoning to permit residential activity within acceptable development standards and requirements. The Wood Street Development Project site contains significant historic structures that include the 16th Street Station and associated elevated tracks, and the 16th Street Signal Tower.

The Wood Street Development Project involves proposed construction resulting in the development of separate mixed-use developments within the overall project site by individual project sponsors, which would consist of residential, live-work and retail uses, along with non-retail commercial space. The Wood Street Development Project involves consideration of two development scenarios; the “Maximum Residential Scenario” and the “Maximum Commercial Scenario.”

The “Maximum Residential Scenario” would consist primarily of residential uses, totaling 1,570 dwelling units, 186 of which would be live-work units. Commercial space would include 13,000 square feet of neighborhood-serving commercial uses plus 14,487 square feet associated with the historic Southern Pacific 16th Street train station. The main hall of the station between 16th and 17th Streets would be restored for reuse; the associated 16th Street signal tower also would be restored. Public open space, consisting of a public plaza in front of the station’s main hall and five pocket parks totaling 1.39 acres (60,670 s.f.) would be provided. In addition, 2.82 acres

(122,925 s.f.) of private open space, which would be accessible to project residents, would also be created. All other existing commercial and industrial floor area would be demolished.

A “Maximum Commercial Scenario,” allowing for specific land uses for some portions of the project site to remain flexible to best respond to future market conditions and allowing for an emphasis on commercial rather than residential uses, would consist of 1,084 dwelling units and 539,266 s.f. of commercial space. The provision of private open space would total 88,350 s.f. The remainder of the development would be completed the same as that under the “Maximum Residential Scenario.”

The proposed Pacific Cannery Lofts development would be part of the “Maximum Residential Scenario” addressed in the Wood Street EIR.

OVERVIEW OF REQUIRED APPROVALS

A Planned Unit Development (PUD) is proposed as the basis for the design, site planning, infrastructure and other major development standards and requirements for the Wood Street Development Project. In this way, a comprehensive and cohesive master plan can be developed for the entire site. The PUD process would involve review of all preliminary grading, public improvements, site plans, and the design of buildings, including architectural elements, height and massing, as well as the subdivision aspects of the property. Within this process, the City will establish the overall framework and development standards for the site through the Wood Street Zoning District, followed by the Preliminary Development Plan (PDP), and then by the more detailed Final Development Plan (FDP) as specific portions of the project are presented for development. The City’s Zoning Code and the proposed Wood Street Zoning District allow the PDP and FDP processes to be combined.

General Plan Amendment

The project site is currently designated *Business Mix/Mixed Housing Type*. The applicants have proposed a General Plan Amendment that would apply a new residential and commercial land use designation to the entire project site. A General Plan Amendment would require action by the Planning Commission with final action by the City Council.

Zoning Amendment

The project applicant is proposing a Master Plan District concept to comprehensively zone the project area for development. The project site is currently zoned *General Industrial (M-30)*, *Mixed Density Light Industrial (M-20)*, and *Industrial –Residential Transition Combining Zone (S-16)*. Approval of rezoning would require action by the Planning Commission with final action by the City Council. In addition, a PUD for the project would also need to be consistent with the proposed land use designation and zoning designations in the Wood Street Zoning District.

Tentative Subdivision Map

The proposed project would require a tentative subdivision map. The project sponsor’s have proposed that a Vested Tentative Map be approved, which would enable successive final maps to be prepared and approved over a multi-year period to sustain the land use approvals for an approximately 8 year time period. This type of map is typical for larger subdivisions that are to be developed in phases over multiple years. The map would be prepared by a registered civil engineer or land surveyor and would require Planning Commission Approval.

CEQA Review

A Draft EIR for the Wood Street Zoning District has been prepared by the City and submitted to the public and local agencies for review. The public review period is now closed and a Final EIR, Response to Comments document, is currently being prepared and will be presented to the Planning Commission within the next few weeks.

Design Review

The proposed project would be subject to Design Review under the City's Zoning Regulations (Section 17.136.070(A)) and would require Planning Commission Approval. Staff is interested in comments from the Design Review Committee and the public regarding the design of the proposed project that may provide direction to the applicant and Staff as design work proceeds toward full Planning Commission Review.

HISTORIC AND CULTURAL RESOURCES

The Draft EIR analysis addressed cultural and historic issues and identified significant and unavoidable impacts related to the historic 16th Street Station and the context of the 16th Street Signal Tower, as well as less than significant impacts associated with other cultural resources within the project vicinity. However, there are two historic districts located within the project area. They are the 16th Street Station Commercial District and the Pacific Coast Canning District. In addition, three historic districts are located in the vicinity of the proposed project. They are the 7th Street Historic Entertainment District; the Oakland Point Historic District; and a portion of the OARB National Register Historic District. A discussion of the characteristics of each of these districts is contained in the Draft EIR (see pages 3.7-3 to 3.7-12).

Applicable Plans and Policies

In evaluating the potential impacts on historic and cultural resources the Draft EIR identified the following applicable plans and policies: National Historic Preservation Act; Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Treatment of Historic Resources with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings; California Register of Historical Resources; California Senate Bill 297 (1982); and policies contained in the Oakland Preservation Element (1994, amended 1998).

The Draft EIR noted that the project would result in significant unavoidable impacts on cultural resources related to project-level historic resources regarding a) loss of a portion of the 16th Street Train Station resulting from the removal of the existing elevated tracks and the baggage wing and b) adverse impacts on the setting and context of the 16th Street Train Station and the 16th Street Signal Tower.

Pacific Coast Canning Company

The Pacific Coast Canning Company was established in Oakland in 1904 by Lew Hing, an immigrant from China, who settled in San Francisco in 1869. The Oakland Icehouse, adjacent to the proposed Pacific Coast Lofts development, was constructed in 1909 and by 1914 the Pacific Coast Canning Company was the third largest canning company on the West Coast. Additional buildings were constructed at the site up to 1928.

The City has conducted four historic resource surveys of the Pacific Coast Canning Company site (1988, 1990, 1994 and 1996). The 1988 survey determined that the buildings had undergone several alterations and changes through the years and insufficient integrity remained for the

structures to be considered eligible for the National Register of Historic Places. Therefore, it is not considered an historic resource under CEQA.

In 1996 a citywide survey established that the individual structures rated a status code Cb - an Area of Secondary Importance, due mainly to a lack of architectural integrity. In addition, the Pacific Coast Canning District is also considered an Area of Secondary Importance. Accordingly, under the General Plan Historic Preservation Element, Policy 3.8, the buildings are not in the first rank of historic importance.

DESIGN ISSUES

The proposed project would be subject to the proposed Wood Street Zoning Regulations, which include three overlay zones establishing design guidelines for the project area. The design guidelines are proposed to help establish a cohesive architectural character for the area requiring a unified and integrated set of architectural elements related to massing, articulation, materials, and the use of architectural detail. The Wood Street Zoning Regulations do not restrict buildings to one particular architectural style or treatment and a variety of architectural styles would be expected to occur within each separate development proposal, each designed to contribute to the urban mix of the area. The Wood Street Zoning Regulations includes a number of design guidelines for the project area that would help guide the provision of new development in the area.

Pacific Cannery Lofts

Much of the original Pacific Coast Canning building will be retained in the proposed development and, in addition, the floor area of the existing building would be expanded and grow from approximately 94,500 square feet to 175,000 square feet. The expansion is due in part to the introduction of interior mezzanines levels and common areas. In addition, live/work façade lofts and courtyard townhouse lofts will be built both within and at the perimeter of the renovated cannery building. However, the adjacent Oakland Icehouse structure to the south of proposed development will remain in place and continue to operate as an industrial use. The project applicant notes that design elements and references to historical character of the existing structure will be included throughout the project. The project applicant states that the common areas within the development will be designed to illuminate and reflect the buildings important past.

Staff believes that the overall site plan, height, and architectural character are appropriate to the area. The proposed project is consistent with other buildings in the immediate neighborhood in terms of building bulk and massing. It should be noted that, because of the configuration of the site, the public aspect of this proposed development will be viewed largely from the Frontage Road on the west side of the site and along a short portion of Pine Street on the east side. Staff has identified a number of design issues that need further consideration as the final design for the project is developed. It is requested that the DRC comment on these issues as well as any other layout or design elements of concern.

Design elements to be evaluated for the Pacific Cannery Lofts development would include, but not be limited to, site structures and furnishings, exterior lighting, paving, landscaping and signage. In addition, staff requests that the Design Review Committee review and comment on several specific issues as follows:

- *Site Plan:* The development of the project will occur while other existing operations in the immediate area continue to operate. These include the Oakland Icehouse and, further to the south, a large waste recycling center. In addition, the interface between the proposed project and planned development on adjacent development parcels in the Wood Street Zoning District is not fully defined. In particular, more detail is required concerning adequate buffering, screening and transition between this use and adjacent industrial uses.

Issue

The proposed residential project should illustrate the proximity of ongoing industrial uses and the development of residential uses on adjoining sites.

- *Frontage Road Elevation:* Along the Frontage Road the elevation of the project would be dominated by the renovated portion of the existing Pacific Coast Cannery building and a smaller section, consisting of new housing construction fronting the proposed four-story garage structure. As a result the renovated character of this frontage will reflect the industrial nature of the building with the addition of large areas of two-story metal frame glass windows. A main entry into the complex will be located near the southern end of the building and the ground plane along the frontage will be graced by new landscaping, trees and entry stoops to individual ground floor units. The scale of the architectural treatment appears to be in scale with the arterial character of the adjacent Frontage Road.

Issue

The industrial aesthetic represented in the design scheme is a response to the renovation of the existing building and the provision of new housing. However, the roofline of the new buildings adjacent to the Pacific Cannery structure could take on a more industrial form consistent with the ASI.

- *Pine Street Elevation:* The Pine Street elevation will have new street trees and sidewalk paving on the east facing frontage of the proposed loft units (Pine Street Lofts). The Pine Street Lofts will act as a screen to the four-story garage structure located on the interior of the site. The character of these units takes on a more residential appearance, similar in character to the three-story townhouses to be built on the eastern (internal) perimeter of the site. The mews-like street character and scale of development at the intersection of Pine and 12th street is illustrated in the project drawings. Staff has a concern that the east elevation of the townhouses may be regarded as the backside of the building and may not relate well with development that will be proposed later for Development Area 3.

Issue

The scale and character of the building frontage on Pine Street can create a mews-like development at the intersection of 12 Street and Pine Street. However, in order to create an elevational treatment more in keeping with the industrial character of the site, the sloping roof portions of the proposed buildings should be replaced by flat roof elements to retain the historical context and reflect a more harmonious building frontage. For instance, the roof level of portions of the Pine Street Lofts could be set at different heights allowing light and air into the interior of the proposed units while creating a façade that links the existing Ice House Building to the renovated Pacific Cannery Lofts structure.

- *Internal Elevations:* The preliminary plans submitted for this review do not illustrate the internal elevation treatments for several structures on the site.

Issue

Staff requests direction on which elevations will the DRC require the developer to prepare so the proposed elevations and details for the building exteriors, including the garage structure, are fully reviewed.

- *Windows, balconies and fenestration details:* The preliminary plans submitted for this review do not illustrate the detailed treatment of building and architectural features. Staff has a concern that the balcony design and other features do not take on a “tacked on” look to the structure and that window recesses be sufficiently deep to provide a distinct building profile.

Issue

The degree of building detail and fenestration needs to be further specified to ensure that design details reflect a high order of architectural quality for exterior design elements.

- *Landscape Plans:* Landscaping can provide a unifying theme for the varied housing types and forms for the site and can be a key to the harmonious development of the site. The sequencing of landscaped elements, tied to respective building types, will greatly enhance the aesthetic quality of the site design. The existing environment of the site is generally barren and unappealing. The applicant has proposed street trees, decorative sidewalk paving, a distinctive the residential entrance, and additional decorative features. The landscape plans represented in the application are in general conformance with the provisions of the Wood Street Zoning District.

Issue

The applicant needs to provide a detailed landscape plan for the site noting transitions between cultivated landscaped areas and the built hardscape environment. Staff requests the DRC provide further direction on the layout and arrangement of landscape features elements with particular attention to the provision of pedestrian amenities, tot lots, play areas, street trees and the design of building entrances.

- *Materials and Colors:* The choice of materials and colors for wall and roof elements will be a critical factor in the look and appearance of this project, from both near by and longer distance views. Staff requests the provision of sample materials and color boards for review. The samples should include materials for windows, doors, balconies, cornices, trim lines architraves, pilasters, columns, railings, and roof forms.

Issue

Staff requests additional direction from the DRC on the provision of additional design details.

- *Exterior Lighting:* The plans provide numerous opportunities where outdoor lighting can be used within pedestrian areas. The applicant will need review the lighting plan with the Electrical Services Division of the Public Works Agency per the City of Oakland’s

outdoor lighting standards adopted in 2002. Security lighting at the garage structure is on particular interest.

Issue

Staff requests additional direction from the DRC on the provision of additional safety and special feature lighting details within the project site and on adjacent public streets.

- *Historic Markers:* The applicant states that common areas within the development will be designed to illuminate and reflect the buildings important past.

Issue

Staff requests direction from the DRC on the provision of historic markers and other special features that recognize the importance of the site and the placement of these features in a sufficiently prominent position(s).

- *Site Design and Layout:* As the project moves forward there are a number of additional items that will need to be explored and for which additional information should be provided. These include the location of entrance and directional signs (e.g. entrance lobby); parking structure signs and lighting; business identification signs; the placement and lighting of a development monument/project identification signs; the function security access gates and security lighting; street lights and nighttime lighting; and the provision of loading areas.

Issue

Staff requests direction from the DRC on the provision of additional information related to site design and security features that are important to the success of the project.

CONCLUSION

Staff believes that the overall conceptual design plan of the project meets the requirements of the Wood Street Zoning District and associated General Plan Amendments. However, Staff recommends the Design Review Committee provide comments and direction on the design of the proposed project with emphasis on the items discussed above, as well as any other issues the Committee may wish to consider.

Respectfully submitted:

Prepared by:

Claudia Cappio
Development Director

Margaret Stanzione, Planner IV
Major Development Projects

Attachments:

- A. Project Plans, Sections, and Elevations
 - B. Site Photographs
-